

Environmental Law Clinic
University of Detroit Mercy School of Law
651 E. Jefferson Ave.
Detroit, MI 48226

Comment Re Consent Decree With DTE

Michigan communities deserve more for the damage caused by DTE's coal-fired plants. Yet this consent decree not only settles for less, but also sends the wrong message to industrial polluters – that it's better to ask for forgiveness than to ask for permission.

Overview

Under the Clean Air Act, utility companies seeking to modify a source of air pollution must make projections of how the modification will affect future emissions.¹ If the projections indicate a major modification, then the company needs a permit under the New Source Review program before going ahead.² The projections do not have to include emissions related to growth in demand.³

In 2010, DTE notified the Michigan Department of Environmental Quality that it will be undergoing a \$65 million-dollar modification of their coal-fired facility in Monroe.⁴ DTE characterized the project as routine maintenance and that the projected increase in emissions will be attributable to demand growth.⁵

The very next day, DTE began construction without a permit.⁶ EPA subsequently sued the company on that basis, finding its projections questionable and arguing that a permit was in fact required.⁷ Four of DTE's other coal-fired plants were also brought into the lawsuit for the same reason.⁸

DTE unsuccessfully sought summary judgment three times in federal court. The company argued that the EPA has no authority to require a permit based solely on a review of their projected emissions.⁹ Instead, it insisted that the agency must wait and see if the modifications result in actual increases in emissions.¹⁰ The Sixth Circuit ruled against DTE's argument twice, and the Supreme Court denied DTE's petition for review.¹¹

¹ 42 U.S.C. § 7475, 7503

² *Id.*

³ 40 C.F.R. § 52.21(b)(41)(a) and (c)

⁴ *United States v. DTE Energy*, 845 F.3d 735, 737 (6th Cir. 2017)

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ *Id.*

⁷ *Id.*

⁸ Notice of violation from EPA to DTE Energy, U.S. EPA (Mar. 7 2013), at 1.
<https://archive.epa.gov/region5/swdetroit/web/pdf/r5-053176.pdf>

⁹ *United States v. DTE Energy*, 2015 WL 995207 (C.A.6), at 8 (Respondent's Brief)

¹⁰ *Id.*

¹¹ *DTE Energy Co. v. U.S.*, 138 S. Ct. 555 (2017)

The consent decree settles for less

By all outward appearances, the EPA has the upper hand at this stage of the litigation. Yet the agency is not only seeking to settle with DTE in the proposed consent decree, but to do so for a civil penalty and mitigation project that together amount to just under \$7.5 million dollars.¹² Michigan communities deserve more for DTE's actions.

To most people, \$7.5 million dollars seems like a lot of money. But companies like DTE are not like most people. In each of the last three years, DTE made over \$1 billion dollars in profits.¹³ That means that from a monetary standpoint, the consent decree in question only imposes obligations amounting to less than 1% of what the company keeps after expenses – hardly much of a deterrent.

Moreover, the EPA could have secured a fairer remedy had it successfully tried the case. Section 113(b) of the Clean Air Act, in tandem with the Federal Civil Penalties Inflation Adjustment Act, authorizes the EPA to seek as much as \$37 500 a day in civil penalties for each of DTE's violations.¹⁴ Assuming at least five violations (one for each coal-fired facility) over a six-month period, the EPA would have secured just over \$33 million dollars in civil penalties.

The decision to settle is made even more questionable given the EPA's relatively strong position in the litigation, as evidenced by both the agency's success in Circuit Court as well as the Supreme Court's denial of DTE's petition for review. By settling the case, the EPA is settling for less.

The consent decree sends the wrong message

By entering into this consent decree, the EPA also signals to industry that when it comes to making major modifications to polluting facilities, it's better to ask for forgiveness than to ask for permission – a message that goes against any pretense of protecting the environment.

After many years of litigation, the Sixth Circuit ruled that it is within the EPA's discretion to require a permit under the New Source Review program based on its own assessment of a company's emission projections.¹⁵ Yet the agency is now deciding not to use its hard-won discretion because of an EPA policy memorandum issued in December of 2017.

The memorandum characterizes the Sixth Circuit decision as having “created uncertainty” and proceeds to reassure industry that the EPA will in fact not conduct its own assessment of a company's projections for purposes of New Source Review.¹⁶

¹² Consent Decree, *United States v. DTE Energy* (No. 266-1, E.D. Mich., May 14, 2020), at 27, 70.

¹³ Macrotrends, “DTE Energy Net Income 2006-2020” (June 16, 2020), <https://www.macrotrends.net/stocks/charts/DTE/dte-energy/net-income>

¹⁴ 42 U.S.C § 7413(b)

¹⁵ *United States v. DTE Energy*, 845 F.3d 735, (6th Cir. 2017)

¹⁶ Memorandum from E. Scott Pruitt, Administrator, U.S. EPA, to Regional Administrators, U.S. EPA (Dec. 7, 2017), https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2017-12/documents/policy_memo.12.7.17.pdf.

Not only does EPA's policy memorandum have no binding legal authority, it also carries dangerous environmental implications. By choosing not to oversee the preconstruction projections of industrial polluters, the EPA gives companies the green light to build first and fix environmental problems later – when the damage is already done.

Meanwhile, the Sixth Circuit has authorized the EPA to be proactive and prevent questionable projections from becoming a problem in the first place. By not exercising the authority awarded to them, the EPA sends the wrong message to industrial polluters – that it's better to ask for forgiveness than to ask for permission.

Concluding Remarks

Over the last century, DTE profited from its coal-fired plants at the expense of Michigan's natural resources and public health. But the EPA has a chance to hold the company accountable by changing the terms of this consent decree as follows:

- 1) **Increase the civil penalty** to adequately reflect the damage caused by coal-fired facilities and to effectively deter large corporations like DTE from circumventing their legal obligations in the future, pursuant to EPA's own Stationary Source Penalty Policy.
- 2) **Require more environmental mitigation** to fully and properly compensate specific Michigan communities that were most affected by DTE's coal-fired facilities.
- 3) **Extend record-keeping** under Section XV (Information Collection and Retention) to cover the full timeline of DTE's obligations under the consent decree.
- 4) **Increase periodic reporting** under Section IX (Periodic Reporting) from semiannually to quarterly, to better prevent against noncompliance.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment and for considering our views.

Sincerely,

/s/Joe Maalouf

Joe Maalouf
Student Attorney
Environmental Law Clinic
University of Detroit Mercy School of Law
651 E. Jefferson Ave.
Detroit, MI 48226

/s/Nicholas J. Schroeck

Nicholas J. Schroeck
Director
Environmental Law Clinic
University of Detroit Mercy School of Law
651 E. Jefferson Ave.
Detroit, MI 48226
313-596-9817

TEXT OF FORM COMMENT: (Submitted 347 times)

To the Assistant Attorney General for Environment and Natural Resources,

I'm writing in support of the consent decree filed in DTE's New Source Review case (United States and Sierra Club v. DTE Energy Company and Detroit Edison Company, D.J. Ref. No. 90-5-2-1-09949), and the separate agreement referenced therein. The consent decree includes projects that are crucial for improving public health and delivering cleaner air to Michiganders. While I understand that the government is not a party to, and need not approve, the separate agreement between DTE and Sierra Club, I would urge you to not object to that agreement, which includes even more impactful clean air and public health benefits that are crucial for River Rouge, Ecorse, and 48217.

Combined, the River Rouge, St. Clair, and Trenton Channel coal-fired power plants annually emit more than seven million tons of climate polluting carbon dioxide, 22,000 tons of harmful sulfur dioxide, and 8,000 tons of smog-causing nitrogen oxides. The separate agreement would ensure that those polluting coal plants are finally retired. And by directing \$5.5 million towards replacing diesel buses with cleaner electric buses, and \$2 million towards community environmental mitigation projects, the separate agreement would provide additional air quality and public health benefits to the long over-burdened environmental justice communities of River Rouge, Ecorse, and 48217. Scientists recently confirmed that exposure to air pollution from coal plants decreases the chance of survival once contracting Coronavirus, exacerbating the already dire threats facing communities in environmental injustice hotspots. Amidst the COVID-19 pandemic, this consent decree and separate agreement couldn't have come at a more crucial time for Michigan communities.

Because of the public health and air quality improvements, I voice my support for the consent decree and even stronger support for the separate agreement between DTE and Sierra Club.

Thank you,

ADDITIONAL COMMENTS TO THE FORM COMMENT:

1. My mother and great uncle worked in Wayne County's most polluted areas for decades. Cleaner air and public health outcomes are long overdue for these communities!

2. Environmental justice is only one step towards a more sustainable future. Consider the weight of your impact on future generations and act upon it.

3. As a lifelong Michigan resident and a DTE customer, I strongly support the Clean Air Act settlement agreement with DTE.

4. This settlement needs to be paid by DTE and Detroit Edison, and paid immediately. \$7.5 million is a pittance to these companies, but will make a big difference in this community that is hurting so badly.

5. DTE--Stop killing people!

6. The historic callousness of DTE and other major players, including Michigan government, toward the health-damaging pollution emitted by DTE plants is long overdue for remedy. Please support this consent agreement.

7. Stop killing our children!

8. We must stop destroying our children's planet!

9. I support 7.5 million for environmental justice. Stop polluting the environment.

10. As a RN I have cared for children with asthma, watching them struggle to catch a breath! We must protect our children and their families in every way that we can. Please, support this action.

11. Clean air is basic to human health and life -- and must come before industrial profits --People first!

12. I live near enough to this unacceptable pollution to feel its effects. It's time to right this wrong.

13. It only makes sense completely rebuild with new eco-technology our plants and power systems without the continued use of fossil fuels in its many forms because we have the capability to do it.

14. As a former resident of this community, whose children played in those parks, I explore you to do the right thing for the children who still reside in those neighborhoods.

15. Pulmonary disease in the senior population is at epidemic levels. The children of today will be the seniors of tomorrow. We cannot ignore the purity of our air and water.

16. I agree, we must do away with things like coal plants, fracking, and other environmental problems and do more with clean energy, clean water, etc. A healthy environment is a prosperous one.

17. SAVE the very earth (dirt) we walk upon. YOU will ultimately find yourselves and your progeny walking through dusty streets of ash. If none of your "group" (special conservatives) do anything to put an end to the abuse of soil, air, water of our earth (USA) in particular you'll find yourselves controlled by whatever powerful FOREIGN group takes over what is now the United States and you will WISH you had thought more carefully and cautiously before destroying yourselves and the United States of America.

18. People over profit!

19. Air quality is more important than ever given that Covid-19 impacts your ability to breathe. Please do what you can to improve the air quality. Act as if your favorite person lived there.

20. I have children and grandchildren. I want them to have clean air and water and a safe world to live in.

21. Clean air is a right of all human beings.

22. DTE has continuously failed to be a responsible corporate citizen. Why does this company still exist? Surely, Michiganders can do better than a corporation that does everything it can to avoid taking responsibility for its actions. Time to take utilities public again.

23. I have grown up Downriver where we care about each other and the environment. Please, do the right thing.

24. Without fresh air we are doomed. Please help keep the air clean!!

25. I voice my support for the consent decree files in Date's New Source Review case (U.S. and Sierra Club v. DTE Energy Co. and Detroit Edison Co, D.J. Ref. No.90-5-2-1-09949. I voice my support for the consent decree and further support for the separate agreement between DTE and Sierra Club. Sincerely, Martha Folts

26. We need to make sure that industrial toxins stay out of Michigan's backyards. It is no wonder why so many people and children have health problems.

27. I too have contracted Asthma after 45 years in Wayne county. Trusting that all involved in this pollution will at long last do the right thing. ..Susan Cushnier

28. Our air has and now impacts our health. We need to make the air better and healthier.

29. Children should have a safe place to play, learn, and experience the outdoors. I believe this to be a basic human right.

30. We need a long break from fossil fuels, especially in the Down River area, and we need it fast.

31. I live in Dearborn Heights and I even reap the detriment of the horrid pollution. Please stop! Clean air is a human right.

32. Here in Michigan, the neighborhood having Zip Code 48217 suffers from very poor health caused by local industries, including the River Rouge coal-fired electric plant that is one of the facilities subject to this consent decree. Homeowners and residents deserve relief, and need more than to have this plant shut down. Please do not intervene in this done deal.

33. You are humans that have a responsibility to do the right thing.

34. The time is now.

35. This settlement has been a long time coming and will provide a basis for redressing the damage to public health in these communities.

36. I worked in Detroit as a teacher and can personally testify to how many children and their family members from these zip codes have asthma and related health problems. I support the consent decree and for the separate agreement between the Sierra Club and DTE. Please listen to the affected community and those of us who stand with them.

37. Please help us move toward clean air for all. Help us evolve and advance and support the separate agreement between DTE and Sierra Club.

38. Please help us all breathe clean air!

39. I'll be so happy to see the right thing done.

40. Everyone should have clean air to breathe, and have no concern about the water that they drink.

41. Everyone should have the right to clean air. I look forward to seeing my state take the right action on this.

42. I am in complete support of the consent decree filed in the DTE's New Source Review case Ref 90-5-2-1-09949. The ability to breathe clean air to promote a healthy life is a human right. It is time that each Michigander live and grow in environmentally safe homes, neighborhoods and communities irrespective of their race, religion, education, and sociological and economic status. It is time for the pollution to be cleaned up and those responsible for the pollution to pay towards that endeavor and take corrective actions to eliminate the cause of the pollution. Please be on the right side of social justice for all by not objecting to this agreement. Thank you for your consideration of my input regarding this matter. Respectfully, Shelley Poliner

43. Please clean up our air so we can live healthy lives.

44. We must force the clean up of the channels of the Rouge. We know the damage that has been done to human and other animal populations. We certainly don't want our grandchildren and future generations to breathe these fumes.

45. It is very important that ALL Americans enjoy the cleanest possible air, water, and food. These are basic necessities of Life, and our Declaration of Independence lists Life as our first Inalienable Right. This is so basic to the integrity of our Nation. DTE must do all it can to clean the air and support the people their dirty energy projects have harmed. Cleaner and healthier alternative energy sources are now available and must be transitioned to as quickly as possible. It is a matter of Life and Breath!

46. Love the Clean Air Act...

47. I have been hearing for years about the dirty air and pollution coming from these places and the health problems it creates.

48. We are the water wonderland. Millions in tourist dollars flow into this state because of our abundant and beautiful natural resources. Our microbrews need clean water to make beer. Clean water is integral to our state of being in Michigan. We need to go to any length to protect it. There are so many alternatives to coal fired energy that do not pollute.

49. Please and Thank You!

50. Community deserve access to clean air and corporations should ensure their presence will not impact neighborhoods negatively and if so restore those communities.

51. We deserve to have a clean and healthy environment that's not subjected to pollution by powerful utility companies who put profit over the health of their customers when then have the money and technology to produce clean safe energy but refuse to do so because of corporate greed! Shame on them! This is 2020! The year of the pandemic that says enough id enough! We want change now!!!

52. Please support the actions of the Sierra Club.

53. A child's zip code shouldn't determine if they have clean air to breath or water to drink. Stop the environmental racism in Michigan!

54. All people need and deserve to have clean air to breathe.

55. be smart and protect the people of this community!

56. Communities deserve to have clean air and water. DTE must step forward and do their part to make this happen.

57. Every community needs to live and thrive in a safe, clean and unpolluted environment. Coal is polluting our environment and world causing onerous climate change which is dangerous to our survival. Shut down the Rouge River coal plant!

58. Eliminating this coal plant is a step toward ensuring the health and safety of all communities.

59. For my nieces and nephews

60. Protecting our environment is a top priority. Please act to clean up and protect the Rouge River and not let polluters off the hook.

61. ECORSE is the city my family chose to call home. My father and nephew retired from us steel and I retired from the 26th district court. I have no family left in ECORSE but many friends still reside in ECORSE.

62. 40 plus years in Ecorse, family still there. Every morning you go out with everything all covered

63. I have been going to this park my whole life, 63 years! Took my daughters. Now take my grandchildren. This needs to have action taking for everyone's health! Numerous people from our community have cancer and other illnesses that I am sure could be tied into this pollution. Just as has been proven against Nationsl Steel that sits on the south side of Belanger Park. I support this effort!

64. DTE spent years pumping toxic waste into the air, water, and earth of communities of color. In consequence, community members in these neighborhoods have suffered with their health. This agreement is a step towards holding private corporations accountable for the violence they have inflicted.

65. Please don't disturb our land

66. The consent decree is an important step in curbing air pollution, but much more must be done.

67. The people of Michigan are pulling together to protect our beautiful home, your zip code should not determine the quality of the air that you and your children breathe.

68. Environmental Racism is just another way that white supremacy bears its teeth within our society. Please, use your power to demand that everyone has the right to a clean and healthful environment.

69. Let's protect our people!

70. Please keep people safe!!!

71. I grew up in this area so it and it's people are important to me. It is a great area right on the river and very important that it should no longer be taken advantage of by industry that wants to exploit not savor and respect. No more pollution for this area and it's living inhabitants including children and people.

72. Clean air is a human right. All people in Michigan, regardless of age, class, race, or zip code deserve clean air. If we want to make progress towards a better future for all, clean air needs to be a priority. Thank you for your consideration.

73. Please support this important decree for environmental justice in our community.

74. Do the right thing

75. Now more than ever, tough choices like this need to be made. Help Michigan be the state to emulate!

76. It is our duty , each of us, when alive, to help improve the planet... Shutting down polluting coal burning power plants is essential to protect human health from lungs disease, heart disease cancer directly caused by toxic emissions (microscopic particles etc.) that harm health.

77. As someone also very much interested in protecting water quality within the Great Lakes basin, I too strongly support the closures of coal fired power plants and the settlement agreement including funding to impacted communities.

78. The environment needs to come first. It has been sacrificed for too long for the benefit of money and profit.

79. Mom still lives in Ecorse. She is 88 years old and moved there when she was 4. She raised 5 kids there. We had grafite dust everywhere. All over us, the cars, everything. We breathed it in.

80. Helping to right the past wrongs and ensure that people who were disadvantaged in the past have a leg up in the future is imperative. This is something that DTE must wholeheartedly agree to. Closing down coal plants, which are no longer cost effective and are a burden to the environment, is the right thing to do.

81. Michigan is my adopted state, and for the sake of all who were born here and call it home, I support the separate agreement between DTE and Sierra Club.

82. These changes are long overdue.

83. COAL AND FOSSIL FUELS MUST STOP! SOLAR AND WIND TURBINES WILL HELP SAVE OUR PLANET FOR OUR CHILDREN. ALSO CREAT JOBS.

84. Nothing is more important than clean air and environment.

85. As the Executive Director for The Asthma and Allergy Foundation of America - Michigan Chapter, I am fiercely advocating for clean air and planet. PROTECT THIS DEAL NOW!

86. Coal is an energy source of the past. It is not doing anyone any good to keep supporting it. Doing so, just puts the U.S. further behind as other countries move forward on cleaner alternative sources of energy. In addition, the pollution from these plants makes the population less able to deal with Covid-19. With so many American lives lost to this pandemic, we should be doing everything in our power to help our citizens have the best chance of fighting it.

87. This is urgent. We need to end environmental racism, and this is a move in the right direction.

88. Fossil fuel consumption and continuation for utility plants is such a giant step backwards. America needs to lead the world and regain trust in our ideals and our treatment of all peoples.

89. Everyone must have a non toxic and clean environment !

90. It is vital that we hold corporation to account and enforce environmental justice! This is vital, and it is the least we can do.

91. Especially at this time, providing resources for communities that have suffered so much is needed and warranted.

92. This action is long overdue but a small consolation to the many who have been medically impaired or killed by DTE coal combustion.

93. The air in Ecorse, River Rouge and the East Side of Dearborn near the Ford Rouge Plant tastes dry and acidic. I don't like the ozone action days where I live and would not like having continual ozone action days because of living downriver near the DTE River Rouge Plant.

94. We are tired of having our air, water, and land poisoned by polluting corporations! I support the Clean Air Act!

95. I support this agreement. It is good for the environment. But besides the environment, China is using tremendous amounts of coal and they are running out (in about 37 years at the current rate of consumption based on U.S. Department of Energy statistics). Once China runs out of coal or even before they run out of coal, the demand for coal worldwide will skyrocket (because of China's needs) and therefore the global price for coal will skyrocket. DTE knows that the future is not coal. Nobody wants to pay \$600 a month for their household electricity. That's what would happen if we didn't plan for alternatives today. Thanks for listening.

96. Support for Lori Goldman

97. Finally action is being taken to help those who've been affected by environmental justice issues! It's about time. If DTE follows through and uses the funds appropriately, I may actually respect their company again.

98. Dear Asst Attorney General, Please protect Michigan citizens

99. We need a healthy Michigan (Planet) for healthy citizens, for a healthy, sustainable economy. Be part of the solution to lessen pollution.

100. It is vital to start improving the areas around these super-polluters. DTE is taking the right step- finally! Please do not interfere with their environmental improvements to these neighborhoods. The people there have suffered enough.

101. I support the settlement -- the funding of EJ projects and the closing of the 3 coal plants.

102. Our Detroit community deserves better than to deal with these deadly toxins that wreak havoc on our health. Please support these measures to protect this deal for cleaner air!

103. Our Detroit community deserves better than to deal with these deadly toxins that wreak havoc on our health. Please support these measures to protect this deal for cleaner air!

104. Our Detroit community deserves better than to deal with these deadly toxins that wreak havoc on our health. Please support these measures to protect this deal for cleaner air!

105. Plants must be retired to help reduce environmental pollutants. Lives depend on it; the planet depends on it.

106. Will the leadership of DTE, just step up to the plate and do the right thing, instead of mucking around.

107. However, you MUST do MUCH more. We MUST keep ALL climate-changing fossil fuels IN THE GROUND! We MUST achieve 100% clean, renewable energy by 2030.

108. Please keep our most valuable resources clean for everybody! Clean air and water shouldn't be something we need to fight for anymore, but here we are. Do the right thing and don't let big business ruin our futures.

109. To Whom It May Concern: I support this settlement. For to long we/communities of color have been plagued with pollution coming into their owns by DTE which uses dirty coal that creates carbon emissions that have harm our and our children's health as well as contributing to climate change that harms mother earth. The funds should be secured to go to programs that will improve the air quality and teach residents about the harmful impacts from dirty energy.

110. Please

111. It's long past time for DTE to do more about emissions in this community and mitigate the harm it has caused.

112. FOR OUR CHILDREN ,WHO ARE OUR FUTURE. IMAGINE, EYES CLOSE. IF THIS WAS YOUR BACKYARD AND YOUR CHILDREN ARE PLAYING AND BREATHING IT!

113. Please do the right thing for Michigan. Please support this consent decree.

114. Please think of the children who, through no fault of their own, are starting out life in this polluted environment. Give them a chance to be healthy by following all the measures of this consent decree.

115. As someone who suffers from COPD, though never a smoker, I wholeheartedly support clean air for young and old, therefore I support cleaning up our air.

116. I have served with Ms. Vicki Dobbins on the Sierra Club Political Committee and know of her health struggles and those of her neighbors at the hands of these large, polluting corporations that have poisoned their communities. It is time for positive change, eliminating coal and finally moving into the 21st century with clean energy and supporting healthy communities.

117. Environmental Justice is a moral issue and keeping in line with my Christian faith.

118. We all need clean air and clean water to live. I love living in Michigan, and I would hope that our environment is kept as clean as possible for all to enjoy clean living in our beautiful state.

119. I grew up in Ecorse and was a member of the Ecorse Rowing Club. For many years, we rowed on the Detroit river behind Great Lakes Steel. Several times a day during practice, we would see ?The Ecorse Sunrise? which was when a huge container would dump some form of molten liquid into a hole. It would then release a sparkling powder (pixie dust) on us as we rowed past the mill. All of us never knew we were breathing poisonous materials. My Grandmother, Grandfather and Uncle who were born and raised in the city ended up dying young or from cancer. All the cities on the Southeast area of the Detroit river beginning in Ecorse all the way to Delray need to fix this!

120. I care about my grandson's health and all of his generation's.

121. Read the book ENERGY OVER DEVELOPMENT AND THE DELUSION OF ENDLESS GROW. We must move toward sustainability.

122. Please help us make this a reality. I truly believe that clean air and reduced carbon emissions are the foundation of a better future for all. Communities of Color have too long been sacrificed to society's need for energy. We know how to make cleaner energy now and we know better than to put the environmental burden on those most vulnerable. Now that we know better, we must do better. Thank you, Amanda

123. When I vote, Environment and Education (including HEALTH concerns of children in all communities) are my main two determinants. Please follow through on closing this coal-fired plant. You/We must. Thank you.

124. We all have the right to live and to breathe clean air as we transition away from coal and other fossil fuels to cleaner, healthier forms of energy.

125. Downriver deserves this money.

126. For too long these downriver communities have been disproportionately impacted by environmental concerns. The DTE coal plants of River Rouge, Ecorse and 48217 are causing extreme health problems, especially now relating to the coronavirus. I urge you to support the \$7.5 million settlement between the Sierra Club and DTE and to do as much as you can to protect these Michigan communities. deserves this money.

127. I support the Sierra Club Michigan and National Beyond Coal Campaign. Lets shut those dirty power plants down quickly and transition to cleaner forms of green energy.

128. I live in Southwest Detroit. My family and friends live in the Delray Community. We have always lived in communities that have been subjected to unclean air and unclean practices. We should not have to live in a community where we expect the air to be unclean,

where we already know pollution fills our lungs. We shouldn't have to worry about young children and the impact that this air pollution can have long term on their health, as we watch the older generations face health repercussions because of the air quality. Taking this step is one if the first towards ensuring clean air is no longer a distant mirage for our community. By shutting retiring these plants for good, we are making moves towards rectifying years of environmental oppression against our communities.

129. A few years ago, as an environmental engineering graduate student, I studied the effects of coal mines on downstream water quality. It is common knowledge in that field that contaminants are several orders of magnitude higher downstream of a mine than upstream. We face the same problem with air quality near coal-fired power plants, contributing to high levels of asthma and other crises of environmental and public health. It is time to move toward cleaner, more breathable air.

130. My nieces and nephews and son need you to stand up for their health... and their future!!

131. I urge you to support and implement important environmental protections that have been allowed to erode over the past few years. Thank you!

132. NO ONE needs to live with pollution. Would YOU want to breathe or live next to pollution?!

133. As an Early Childhood Interventionist, I urge you to take action to reduce pollution that deeply affects development of young children. River Rouge children and many others across our state are already growing up compromised by poverty and unstable home environments. The effects of pollution on their neurological development is significant. Please take action!!

134. Please do the right thing for the people in Ecorse!!